

Incel Indoctrination Rubric (IIR): Summary and Research

THINKING		
1. Misogyny	He has an over-arching, negative and limited view of women. He describes women in an objective, one-dimensional manner and sees the heart of their worth as that of a sexual possession. He rates their worth on a 1-10 scale. This item encompasses homophobic and transphobic beliefs.	1, 2, 3, 5, 7-14, 16, 18-25, 27, 29, 31-33, 35-43, 45-48, 50
2. Racism	There is a lack of appreciation for diversity or any divergence from the straight, white, cisgender ideal and a sense of superiority of the white race over all others. This would also include antisemitic beliefs.	6, 7, 11, 18, 20, 21, 24, 27, 29, 37, 38, 41, 45, 49
3. Blackpill	He believes that genetics predetermine his status and desirability and cannot be overcome. He has a sense of inferiority, hopelessness, and growing rage at the lack of sexual prospects available to him.	1, 3-5, 9, 10, 13, 18, 19, 21, 24, 25, 29, 39, 41, 43, 45-47
4. Inaccurate Self-Concept	This bi-bifurcated construct exists on two extremes on a spectrum – either an overly negative self-worth that leads to low self-esteem and value or an overly inflated sense of value and entitlement.	2, 4, 10, 11, 14, 15, 18-22, 24, 25, 27-33, 35, 37-39, 41, 43, 45, 47
5. Fame Seeking	There is a strong desire to achieve fame and make a statement. He thinks that he is the chosen one, with a sense of purpose that has alluded him throughout his life. He often finds worth in the idea of communicating a message to society to set things right and unmask the injustices he has endured.	2, 5, 7, 8, 11, 13, 14, 18-21, 23-25, 27-33, 35, 37-41, 43, 46, 48
FEELING		
6. Rage	There is an intense anger and rage directed toward women, alpha males, other non-white males (seen as “less than”), and/or the society at large for contributing to his marginalized status without a chance for redemption. He feels justified because of the unfairness of his situation and the need for revenge.	1, 3, 5, 9-11, 13, 14, 16-21, 24, 25, 27-31, 33, 36-38, 43, 39, 40, 41, 43-45, 47, 48, 50
7. Hopelessness	He experiences a pervasive sense of sadness and desperation at the prospective of considering the future. There is a sense of futility and desperateness regarding any positive change in the future.	1, 3, 6, 9, 10, 13-22, 24, 25, 28, 29, 32, 33, 36-39, 41, 43, 47
8. Catastrophe	Unfortunate negative events, such as a breakup or difficulty obtaining a first date, are given a larger, catastrophic emphasis that provides a frame for the individual seeing himself as a worthless failure.	1, 5, 8-11, 13-16, 18-22, 24, 25, 27-30, 32-35, 37-39, 41-43, 47
9. Disability	There is a mental or physical illness or disability that creates an increased difficulty in social connection with both interaction and reading social cues. Because of this, he struggles to form relationships.	1, 2, 3, 10, 15, 18, 20, 22, 24, 26, 29, 37-39, 42, 44
10. Abandoned	He experiences pervasive feelings of being misunderstood, neglected, abandoned or deserted. He feels alone in the world and that no one cares about his troubles or descent into increasing pain.	1-4, 7-10, 13-15, 18-22, 24, 25, 28, 29, 32, 33, 37-39, 41-43, 47
BEHAVIOR		
11. Approach Behaviors	A term first coined by Meloy (2014), this describes behaviors that threaten others. These behaviors are often impulsive, affective, adrenaline filled actions moving toward harming attractive women, alpha males who date them, and a society that unjustly supports the biological deck stacked against the incel.	3, 12-14, 16-18, 20-22, 24, 27, 31-33, 35-41, 44, 50
12. Howling	A term coined by Calhoun and Westin (2009), howling refers to conditional, transient threats that are made against others primarily to intimidate and to force a fight, flight, or flee reaction. He frequently expresses frustration toward women, alpha males, and/or society at large, often on social media.	1, 5, 10, 12, 14, 15, 18, 20, 22, 24, 27-30, 36-43, 47, 48, 50
13. Suicide	He makes a suicide attempt or statement (often as a threat of murder/suicide). This is often done out of frustration and may be an attempt to control and influence a woman or others. These suicide attempts can occur frequently and are often related to the incel’s frustration in dating relationships.	1, 3-6, 10, 11, 13, 14, 16-18, 20-22, 24, 26, 28, 29, 32, 35-39, 41, 43, 46, 47, 49
14. Past Attacks	He references past attacks, shootings or negative actions toward women to praise other violent actors. This may include an infatuation with prior killers/actors and/or collecting information about them.	2, 13, 22, 24, 28, 29, 32, 37-39, 41, 45, 50
15. Redpill	He seeks to change his appearance, behavior, status or worth through physical exercise, cosmetic surgery, or obtaining wealth in order to overcome his genetic deficiencies and attract women.	8, 10, 13, 14, 21, 23, 24, 28, 37, 39, 40
ENVIRONMENT		
16. Incel Materials	He is frequently exposed to and engages in incel, white supremacist/nationalist, homophobic, transphobic, ableist, ageist, and/or antisemitic ideas through peers, media, family messaging and/or online.	3, 21, 22, 24, 27, 29, 30, 34, 37-39, 41, 46
17. Rejection	Women reject sexual or romantic advances from him with the assumed reason being related to his genetics, lack of women’s interest, or their preference for men who are superior. These continued rejections feed into his feelings of futility at attempts at change or continued efforts to attract women.	1, 3, 7-11, 13, 15, 17-22, 24, 25, 27, 29, 32-34, 37-39, 41, 43-45, 47
18. Bullied	He is often teased about his appearance, sexual unattractiveness or inability to find a sexual partner. Bullying often occurs in front of others, causing feelings of negative self-worth or lack of acceptance.	1, 2, 9, 11, 15, 18, 19, 21, 22, 24, 28, 29, 32, 38, 39, 47
19. Failure to Change	Previous attempts at changing thoughts or behaviors in the pursuit of romantic or sexual relationships have been met with frustration and exacerbation, leading to an unwillingness to continue these efforts.	5, 8-10, 13, 14, 16, 18-22, 24, 28, 29, 32, 36-39, 42, 43
20. Free Fall	There may have been abuse, traumatic loss, or family change/discord, all feeding into feelings of worthlessness. Often a triggering event leads to an increase in anger or tendencies toward violence.	1, 2, 5, 6, 9, 13, 14, 16, 18-22, 24, 26, 28, 29, 32, 33, 37-39, 42, 43, 47

Incel Indoctrination Rubric (IIR): Summary and Research

CASES REVIEWED

1. Tsuyama Massacre, 5/21/1938, Kamo, Tsuyama, Japan
2. Rose-Mar College of Beauty Shooting, 11/13/1966, Mesa, Arizona
3. St. Pius X High School Shooting, 10/27/1975, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada
4. Queen Street Massacre, 12/8/1987, Melbourne, Victoria, Australia
5. École Polytechnique Massacre, 12/6/1989, Montreal, Quebec, Canada
6. University of Iowa Shooting, 11/1/1991, Iowa City, Iowa
7. Oklahoma City Bombing, 4/19/1995, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma
8. Unabomber, 1978-1996
9. Pearl High School Shooting, 10/1/1997, Pearl, Mississippi
10. Thurston High School Shooting, 5/20-21/1998, Springfield, Oregon
11. Columbine Shooting, 4/20/1999, Littleton, Colorado
12. Rancho Cordova Massacre, 8/31/2001, Rancho Cordova, California
13. Sacramento Rampage, 9/10/2001, Sacramento, California
14. Arizona Nursing College Shooting, 10/28/2002, Tucson, Arizona
15. Rocori High School Shooting, 9/24/2003, Cold Spring, Minnesota
16. Platte Canyon School Hostage Crisis, 9/27/2006, Bailey, Colorado
17. Amish Schoolhouse Shooting, 10/2/2006, Nickel Mines, Pennsylvania
18. Virginia Tech Shooting, 4/16/2007, Blacksburg, Virginia
19. Akihabara Massacre, 6/8/2008, Chiyoda, Tokyo, Japan
20. Henry Ford Community College Shooting, 3/10/2009, Dearborn, Michigan
21. LA Fitness Shooting, 8/4/2009, Collier, Pennsylvania
22. Sandy Hook Shooting, 12/14/2012, Newtown, Connecticut
23. Boston Marathon Bombing, 4/15/2013, Boston, Massachusetts
24. Isla Vista Killings, 5/23/2014, Isla Vista, California
25. Portsmouth Stabbings, 6-7/2014, Portsmouth, UK
26. Germanwings Flight 9525, 3/24/2015, French Alps
27. Charleston Church Shooting, 6/17/2015, Charleston, South Carolina
28. Live TV Shooting, 8/26/2015, Roanoke, Virginia
29. Umpqua Community College Attack, 10/1/2015, Roseburg, Oregon
30. 4Chan Threat, 10/1/2015, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
31. Planned Parenthood Shooting, 11/27/2015, Colorado Springs, Colorado
32. Pulse Nightclub Shooting, 6/12/2016, Orlando, Florida
33. Nice Truck Attack, 7/14/2016, Nice, France
34. Lucky 97 Security Guard, 7/31/2016
35. Las Vegas Music Festival Shooting, 10/1/2017, Las Vegas, Nevada
36. Texas Church Shooting, 11/5/2017, Sutherland Springs, Texas
37. Aztec High School, 12/7/2017, Aztec, New Mexico
38. Stoneman Douglas High School Shooting, 2/14/2018, Parkland, Florida
39. Toronto Van Attack, 4/23/2018, Toronto, Ontario, Canada
40. United States Attempted Mail Bombing, 10/2018, Aventura, Florida
41. Tallahassee Yoga Studio Shooting, 11/2/2018, Tallahassee, Florida
42. Capital Gazette Shooting, 12/28/2018, Annapolis, Maryland
43. Women's March Threat, 01/2019, Provo, Utah
44. Mall of America Attack, 04/12/2019, Bloomington, Minnesota
45. Sudbury Michael's Stabbing, 06/03/2019, Sudbury, UK
46. Dallas Federal Courthouse Shooting, 6/17/2019, Dallas, Texas
47. Dayton Shooting, 8/4/2019, Dayton, Ohio
48. Chicago Women's Reproductive Health Clinic Threat, 8/21/2019, Chicago, Illinois
49. German Hookah Bar Attack, 2/19/20, Hanau, Germany
50. Cyberstalking Case, 4/21/2020, Los Angeles, California

SELECTED REFERENCES

- Calhoun, F. & Weston, S. (2009). *Threat Assessment and Management Strategies: Identifying the Howlers and Hunters*. Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.
- Ging, D. (2019). Alphas, betas, and incels: Theorizing the masculinities of the manosphere. *Men and Masculinities*, 22(4), 638-657
- Lankford, A. (2018). Identifying Potential Mass Shooters and Suicide Terrorists with Warning Signs of Suicide, Perceived Victimization, and Desires for Attention or Fame. *J Pers Assess*, 5, 1–12.
- Meloy, J. R., Hart, S., & Hoffmann, J. (2014). *Tt. (Eds.), The international handbook of threat assessment*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Murphy, A. & Van Brunt, B. (2017). *Uprooting Sexual Violence in Higher Educations: A guide for Practitioners and Faculty*. NY: Taylor and Francis.
- National Threat Assessment Center (NTAC). (2019). *Protecting America's Schools: A United States Secret Service Analysis of Targeted School Violence*. United States Secret Service, Department of Homeland Security.
- O'Toole, M. E. (2014). The Mission-Oriented Shooter: A New Type of Mass Killer. *Journal of Violence and Gender*, 1(1), 9-10.
- Pressman, D. (2009). *Risk Assessment Decisions for Violent Political Extremism*. Ottawa, Canada: Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada.
- Prior, T. (2020) Exploring the Links Between Subordinate Masculinities and Violence: the Case of Involuntary Celibates (Incels) | Discover Society. Retrieved May 06, 2020,
- Scaptura, M., & Boyle, K. (2019). Masculinity Threat, "Incel" Traits, and Violent Fantasies Among Heterosexual Men in the United States. *Feminist Criminology*.
- Sokolow, B., Van Brunt, B., Lewis, W., Schiemann, M., Murphy, A. & Molnar, J. (2019). *The NaBITA Risk Rubric*. King of Prussia, PA: NaBITA
- Turner, J. & Gelles, M. (2003). *Threat Assessment: A Risk Management Approach*. NY: Routledge.
- Van Brunt, B. (2015a). *Harm to Others: The Assessment and Treatment of Dangerousness*. Alexander, VA: American Counseling Association.
- Van Brunt, B. (2016). Assessing Threat in Written Communications, Social Media, and Creative Writing. *The Journal of Violence and Gender*, 3(2), p. 78-88.
- Van Brunt, B., Murphy, A., & Zedginidze, A. (2017). An Exploration of the Risk, Protective, and Mobilization Factors Related to Violent Extremism in College Populations, 4(3), p. 81-101.
- Van Brunt, B. & Pescara-Kovach, P. (2019). Debunking the Myths: Mental Illness and Mass Shootings. *Journal of Violence and Gender*, 6(1), p. 53-63.
- Van Brunt, B. & Taylor, C. (in press). *Understanding and Treating Incels: Case Studies, Guidance, and Treatment of Violence Risk in the Involuntary Celibate Community*. NY: Taylor and Francis.
- Van Brunt, B., Solomon, J. & Lewis, W. (in press). *An Educator's Guide to Assessing Threats in Student Writing: Social Media, Email, and other Narrative*. NY: Routledge.